

Government of Pakistan
Ministry of Planning Development & Special Initiatives
Pakistan Bureau of Statistics
Islamabad

Subject: **MINUTES OF THE 4TH MEETING OF CENSUS MONITORING COMMITTEE HELD ON 14TH DECEMBER 2022**

The 4th meeting of Census Monitoring Committee (CMC), constituted by the Council of Common Interest (CCI), was held on 14th December, 2022 at 2.00 P.M under the chair of Prof. Ahsan Iqbal, Federal Minister for PD&SI in National Census Coordination Center(N3C), Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Islamabad to review progress of 7th Population & Housing Census, “**the first ever Digital Census**”. The list of the participants is at **Annexure A**.

2. Meeting started with the recitation of few verses from the Holy Quran. After the round of introduction of the participants, Dr. Naeem uz Zafar, Chief Statistician, PBS briefed about the agenda of the meeting including Progress review of the census activities, Appointment of Provincial Census Commissioners, Security Mechanism, provision of trainers and venues with facilities for training of trainers (TOTs) at Divisional level and training of enumerators (TOEs) at census district level and Final publication of results.

Agenda item 1: Progress review of the activities of 7th Population and Housing Census

3. Dr Naeem uz Zafar, Chief Statistician, PBS presented detailed progress of Census activities and informed that in pursuance of decisions of the 49th meeting of Council of Common Interest (CCI) in January 2022, necessary preparations were initiated and PBS involved the multiple stakeholders for successful accomplishment of national level gigantic activity of Digital Census. He further informed that NADRA, NTC, SUPARCO, Armed Forces and Provincial governments have been involved for provision of 126000 tablets with Census ERP, Data Infrastructure (storage & computing facilities), High resolution imagery, provision of security to field staff and provision of field staff. Finally, he dilated upon the activities which have been completed so far, the some are mentioned below:

- Deputation of **trained staff at 495 census districts**
- Establishment of **495 Census Support centers**, fully equipped with IT equipment and furniture fixture which will be hub of Census field technical and support services activities
- **121000 field staff** from provinces has been allocated for field work.
- **Print / Electronic Media Firms / Social Media** firm engaged for Publicity for first ever Digital Census through PID.
- **Call Centers / SMS Gateway (9727)** and **UAN (0800-57574)** established for Complaint Management System -- Quality Assurance through CATI.
- Establishment of **National Census Coordination Center (N3C)** equipped with video wall and interconnected video conferencing system has been established for centralized decision making for the close coordination with all the federating entities. Similarly, dedicated **Provincial Census Coordination Center(P3C)** in line with N3C have been already fully established in provincial H/Qs Sindh and Punjab for efficient coordination and monitoring.
- It was also informed that PBS has received **87000 Tablets** so far, which have been hardened and ready for dispatch to Census Support Centers.
- High resolution imagery of **132 districts** with 0.98 m and **12 big cities** (complete districts) with 0.3m resolution have been received, tiled and uploaded on map server.

- Pilot Census Successfully conducted in **33 districts** all over Pakistan, AJK & GB as per recommendations of Census Advisory Committee for testing the tools and technology.

At this point the worthy Chair, inquired what will be mechanism for use of hardware and furniture fixture procured and distributed in field after census activity. Chief Statistician responded that PBS is facing shortage of resources therefore the said procurement will be used to fulfil the need of organization. It was added by Mr. Muhammad Sarwar Gondal Member (SS/RM) PBS, that PBS will retain around 30,000 tablets for its regular surveys and censuses and is in process to devise the policy for distribution of tablets to field staff on the basis of work quality and efficiency during census operations, the same will be submitted for approval of the competent forum.

- It was also mentioned that training is the most critical component of the whole process for quality data collection, therefore PBS has designed the extensive three tier training program using modern technologies including interactive manuals, audio/video tutorials and mock sessions. Accordingly,
 - **300 Master trainers** have been trained at Islamabad for training of trainers (TOTs) w.e.f. **5th December 2022-15th December 2022**
 - Training of the **2875 Trainers** at division level has been scheduled on **19th Dec. 2022**
 - Training of **121,000 Field Staff** has been scheduled on **7th Jan. 2023 at 1,410 venues**

The chair enquired about monitoring mechanism of TOTs training. Chief Statistician apprised the forum that detailed monitoring mechanism has been prepared with involvement of Monitors from PBS and academia and UNFPA is providing support in this regard for effective monitoring. Further Zoom links will be established from N3C and P3C for the online monitoring of TOTs.

- **16 Census Software Modules** designed (**3 data collection modules, 13 administrative modules**) with both offline/online data collection mode, however, finalization of Census ERP is under process and NADRA has committed to deliver the completed major modules along with critical module of role-based monitoring dashboards by **16th December 2022**.
- Based on the provided modules, PBS has conducted mini pilot as per decisions of the Census Monitoring Committee in the Rawalpindi Division for testing the flow of the system and its management before full rollout.

Chief Statistician, PBS informed that keeping in view the sensitivity of the matter, special arrangements have been made for the audit and NTISB will conduct the audit from the government side. PBS has also hired third party for information security audit which will cover all aspects from Infrastructure, hardware, software, pen testing etc. Keeping in view the challenging timelines, it is essential that all the necessary documentation and access to hardware and infrastructure may be provided by NADRA and NTC urgently for audit and further improvements in system before full rollout to avoid any untoward situation during mammoth field operations.

- Mr. Gohar Ahmed Khan, Chief Project Officer, NADRA assured that the required documents have been prepared and will be shared with PBS. He also confirmed that NADRA will complete software development **by 16th December 2022**.

Chief Statistician underlined that infrastructure provisioning for digital census is the responsibility of NTC, but few vital infrastructural components like Oracle Exadata, IBM Guardium, Oracle Data guard are still not provided due to non- clearance by the State bank, which are creating delay in execution of activities by NADRA and audit of the system. Minister Inquired from NTC regarding the foreign exchange involved in the import of the said.

- Mr. Amjad Awan Director NTC, informed that it has requested all concerned but so far, no success and hardware is already procured at Hongkong, however, despite the several efforts in last three months, NTC could not be able to get the clearance. Once allowed, it will be airlifted, and as all the configuration has already been made in the hardware, so it will be

ready to use once received. Minister PD&SI asked director NTC to share details so that Governor State bank may be approached for early resolution of matter.

After detailed deliberations the following decision were made: -

Decisions:

- NADRA will provide all finalized software complete in all respect by **16th December 2022** and also ensure to provide the necessary documentation with all requirements to PBS for forwarding the same to Information Security Audit firm by **16th December 2022**.
- NTC will prepare brief regarding the issue in import of the required items for conduct of census operations by **15th December** for intervention by Minister PD&SI to amicably resolve the matter.
- NTC will ensure the availability of configured hardware within one week of its availability.

Agenda item 2: Appointment / non-joining of Provincial Census Commissioners (PCCs) from Provincial Governments

4. Chief Statistician, PBS highlighted that as conduct of the Census activities is the responsibility of the Provincial governments, therefore all training, field operations resultantly monitoring of the activities are executed by the staff of the Provincial Governments. Accordingly, for coordination and smooth execution of Census field operations and monitoring for the conduct of Census it is prerequisite to appoint Provincial Census Commissioners (PCCs) in each province as per the General Statistics (Re-organization) Act, 2011. For this purpose, after talking nominations from Provinces, PBS moved the summary which was approved by Federal Cabinet on 10th June 2022 and Establishment Division notified the officers as PCCs on 2nd August 2022 but none of the notified officers were relieved from the respective governments due to their engagements in other activities and the other may be reason is the difference in pay & allowances of approximately 150,000 to 300,000. It was informed that only PCC of Gilgit Baltistan has joined as PCC along with his current duties. The Chief Statistician further said that all governments have sent the alternative nominations but it is feared that again no one will join even after approval of Federal Cabinet due to difference in perks & privileges. Minister PD&SI was of view that as census field operations has to be conducted by Provinces, therefore for resolution of the matter, the officers may remain on the provincial government's pool with same pay & allowances but also be given additional duty of PCCs. They will work in the provincial headquarters and will play a role of coordinator for smooth execution of the census operations. Detailed deliberations were made and opinion from all provinces/ regions were taken. All agreed with idea, however provinces were of view that orders may be issued from Establishment Division. After detailed deliberations the following decisions were made:

Decisions: -

- Minister PD&SI asked all provincial governments to nominate their officers for appointment as Provincial Census Commissioner within a week. They will work in respective provincial capital for smooth execution of census operations and will remain on the pool of provincial governments on same perks & privileges.
- The PCCs will also report to Chief Statistician till census completion and Federal government will notify their assignment.
- Government of the Punjab will withdraw their letter for replacement.

Agenda item 3: Discussion on Census Field security arrangements

5. It was informed that as per CCI decision, provision of security to census field staff on man to man basis is mandate of armed forces. However, Armed forces presented their plan according to

which police will provide dedicated security to enumerators, while Additional Police / FC / Levies for security of enumerators will be provided in high threat areas. The Armed forces will be available at some distance as a Quick Response Force (QRF) at Charge level, Circle or block level as per threat assessment. It was highlighted by Member (SS/RM) that, accordingly Ministry of Interior has notified this arrangement but due to such arrangements PBS faced problems of provision of security to enumerators during pilot. Therefore, to avoid such situation during full rollout, armed forces may devise their plan by involving provincial governments as the mandate of security provision lies with Armed forces. At this point, Lt Col Adeel Obaid, G1 Military operations Directorate, Rawalpindi, apprised the forum that problems in communication was faced during pilot, but later on the coordination with the Provincial governments improved and all the issues resolved within first three days. He further added that Armed forces has accordingly made comprehensive one to one plan for coordination with provinces and waiting for appointment of Provincial Census Commissioners, as they will act as linchpin for effective coordination for execution of census activities between Federation & Provinces. He was of view that PBS may communicate the Home Departments of respective provinces/ region regarding the matter so that relevant corps will take up the matter accordingly. The following decision was made:

Decisions: -

- Armed forces will coordinate with Provincial governments for utilization of Police for security to the field staff as provision of security is mandate of Armed Forces as per CCI decision.
- PBS may write to Home departments to extend cooperation to Armed Forces for devising security plan along with logistics for provision of security during field operations of 7th Population & Housing Census.

Agenda item 4,5 &6: Allocation / shortage of Field Staff, Provision of Trainers of Trainees (ToTs) and Provision of Training Venues at Divisional and Tehsil level

6. Chief Statistician shared that the provinces have already deputed staff for the census field operations, however, there is shortage of staff provision in ICT and around 300 staff are still required for completion of field activities. Qaiser Naseem Kiani, Magistrate Rural, Chief Commissioner Office Islamabad informed that ICT administration has already provided around 800 staff and requested the Education department for provision of remaining. He added that Education Department have informed that remaining staff will be provided after conduct of Local Government Elections in ICT on 31st December 2022. Member (SS/RM) PBS apprised that in some instances there are posting/transfers being done of already deputed staff which are creating impediments in the smooth execution of the census activities, therefore, there is need that transfer/posting of deputed provincial staff for census activity may be banned. Minister PD&SI agreed with the proposal and directed to inform the concerned provincial government to ensure implementation of the decision. Chief Statistician, PBS mentioned that as Pakistan is going to conduct the first ever Digital Census, therefore extensive three tier training program for field staff has been designed using interactive manual and presentation with audio/ video tutorials both for subject & IT matters. It further detailed upon that 300 Master Trainers from all over Pakistan have been trained in Islamabad in 5 batches w.e.f. 5th December -15th December 2022, who will train around 2875 trainers at divisional level for further imparting training to around 121000 field staff in 1410 venues at census district level. It was informed that the Digital Census requires training venues with facilities i.e. laptops, projector, UPS/generator and internet. However, PBS is facing shortage of training venues with required facilities, which is crucial for successful completion of training for quality data collection. Province-wise, shortage of venues with facilities was presented in detail and it was informed that as conduct of census operations and its monitoring is mandate of provinces, therefore the respective Chief Secretaries may direct the relevant administration for provision of venues with required facilities and if it is inevitable that required facilities may be rented. It was assured that PBS will provide funds to

District Administration for this purpose from the Digital Census Budget on the provision of original receipt. Minister PD&SI directed all provincial governments to ensure availability of required field force and venues for digital census considering this as a National Task. After detailed deliberations, the following decisions were made:

Decisions: -

- ICT administration will make all efforts for timely provision of required staff to PBS for census operations
- Chief Secretaries of all Provinces/region ensure availability of the required number of trainers, training venues with required facilities. If needed the require facilities may be hired on rental basis, PBS will provide funds required from the Digital Census budget.
- Transfer/posting of deputed provincial staff for census activity may be banned by the Provincial Governments till completion of the Census field activities for smooth execution.

Agenda item 7: Publication of official results of census by 30th Dec. 2022

7. It was highlighted by the Chief Statistician, PBS that as per CCI decision census results were required to be finalized by 31st December 2022, but due to delay in provision of tablets, the official results of digital census will be available by 30th April 2023. In this regard, a revised summary was submitted to CCI through Prime Minister. The Prime Minister has desired that M/o PD&SI, Election Commission of Pakistan, PBS and NADRA shall sit together and suggest the way forward in the matter, **i.e. Publication of Census results by 30th Dec. 2022 for delimitation.** Accordingly, on directions of the Minister PD&SI, the matter was put on the agenda of Census Monitoring Committee and Election Commission was especially invited. It was informed that on direction of Minister PD&SI, PBS and NADRA already worked together on the possibilities of reducing the time but not possible as timelines were already squeezed for delivery of tablets (which is badly affected due to COVID-19 pandemic and Economic crunch). The Chairman requested representative of ECP to share his view regarding census results availability. Representative from ECP pointed out that due to increase in census blocks, ECP has to revise the delimitations which are required to be ready by July 2023. Minister directed PBS and ECP officials to mutually coordinate and share the available data of blocks which can be shared only for ECP's internal working so that ECP may proceed in its activity in incremental scenario. He informed that Census is a sensitive matter and Government of Sindh has concerns on the publication of final results of 6th Population & Housing Census, therefore, Government of Pakistan decided to Conduct new Census. All efforts may be made to conduct census on agreed timelines with transparency for provision of credible data. Member (SS/RM) highlighted that PBS has also requested the ECP to nominate a Focal Person to be part of working group which have been assigned preparation of timely statistics generation for ECP, so the approved census results may be shared with ECP well in time. The following decisions were made: -

Decisions: -

- Representatives of Election Commission of Pakistan May be invited in the Census Monitoring Committee meetings and they may also be kept onboard regarding all decisions.
- PBS may share the latest available position of blocks with ECP for their internal use only.
- ECP may nominate their Focal Person in the PBS working group for timely preparation of Census Statistics as per requirement of ECP for delimitation process.

Agenda item 8: Any other item with permission of chair

8. Representative from army underlined that question regarding livestock and land ownership may be included in census questionnaire. Member (SS/RM) PBS, clarified that PBS is going to conduct agriculture census, right after Population and Housing Census, which will have detailed information regarding the livestock and holding .Minister PD&SI added that questions regarding

ownership and the assets led to under-reporting and also will overall affect the data quality due to burden on the respondents, therefore the required information may be gathered from specialized activity for this purpose, i.e. Integrated Agriculture Census.

9. Mr. Gohar Ahmed Khan, Chief Project Officer, NADRA, raised the issue of non-payment of full mobilization amount for tablets and the remaining amount for tablets as already NADRA has delivered almost 86000 tablets and 21000 will be reached within week. Minister PD&SI asked the Joint Secretary, Finance Division for resolution of matter. The Joint Secretary Finance assured the 5 billion will be surrendered within two days. Minister PD&SI also directed Senior Joint Secretary PD&SI to also process the case of 24 billion immediately with Finance for timely completion of Census activities.

Decisions: -

- Ministry of Finance will surrender Rs. 5 billion within two days.
- Senior Joint Secretary PD&SI to also process the case of 24 billion immediately with Ministry of Finance for timely completion of Census activities.

10. The meeting ended with note of thanks by the chairman.

PARTICIPANTS OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE CENSUS MONITORING COMMITTEE 7TH
POPULATION & HOUSING CENSUS-2022**Physical Attendance**

1. **Mr. Muhammad Ahsan Iqbal, Minister of PD&SI / DCPC** (Chairman)
2. Mr. Iftikhar Gilani, Senior Joint Secretary, PDSI, Islamabad
3. Mr. Munir Ahmad, Senior Joint Secretary, Finance Division
4. Syed Zaheer Islam, Secretary Local Government, KP
5. Mr. Zafar Iqbal Hussain, Special Secretary, ECP, Islamabad
6. Dr. Naeem uz Zafar, Chief Statistician, PBS, Islamabad
7. Ms. Sarah Aslam, Joint Secretary, CCI
8. Mr. Muhammad Sarwar Gondal, Member (SS/RM), PBS, Islamabad
9. Mr. Ayazuddin, Member (C&S), PBS, Islamabad.
10. Dr. Amjad Sandhu, DG(Admn), PBS, Islamabad.
11. Ms. Rabia Awan, DDG (CPC, CPMU), PBS, Islamabad.
12. Mr. Gohar Ahmed Khan, Chief Project Officer, NADRA
13. Mr. Ghulam Nabi, DG, HEC, Islamabad
14. Mr. Shahid Iqbal, ADG, ECP, Islamabad
15. Dr. Liaqat Hussain, SMBR, Rep, CS GoAJK
16. Mr. Muhammad Adnan Nazir, DS(A-II), PDSI, Islamabad
17. Col. Omar, Dy. Comd 46 B- Dept. C/O, GHQ
18. Lt. Col. Abdul Obaid, GSO-1, M/O DTE
19. Lt. Col. Masroor, GSO-1, AAD Comd
20. Ch. Abdul Fayyaz Chattha, Director, HEDR
21. Mr. Bashir Khan, Deputy Director, HEC, Islamabad
22. Mr. Amjed Ali Awan, Director, IT, NTC, Islamabad
23. Mr. Farakh Jalees, Director (FS-II), PBS, Islamabad
24. Mr. Qaiser Iqbal, Director, NADRA, Islamabad
25. Mr. M.Yasir Ishfaq, Director, PBS, Islamabad
26. Ms. Sobia Munawar, Director, PBS, Islamabad
27. Mr. Rafique Hussain Talpur, Director (FS), PBS, Islamabad
28. Mr. Muhammad Ehtesham, Director, PBS, Islamabad
29. Mr. M. Faheem Khan, Project Director, NADRA, PBS, Islamabad
30. Raja Zulfarnain, LG & RDD-AJK, Dy. Director
31. Mr. Qaiser Naseem Kiani, MIC(R)
32. Mr. Obaid Abbasi, DCU-COM, M/O PDSI, Islamabad
33. Mr. Muhammad Sarfaraz, CSO, PBS, Islamabad.
34. Mr. Wasi ul Islam, SO (PBS), M/o PD&SI, Islamabad.
35. Ms. Masheed, SO, PBS, Islamabad.

**ZOOM PARTICIPANTS OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE CENSUS MONITORING COMMITTEE
FOR CONDUCT OF 7TH POPULATION & HOUSING CENSUS-2022**

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

1. Mr. Kamran Ahmed Afridi, Special Secretary, Planning & Dev. KP
2. Mr. Mohtasim Billa, Special Secretary, Education, KP
3. Mr. Barkat Ullah, Special Secretary (ESED), KP
4. Mr. Zakir Hussain Afridi, SMBR, KP

Punjab

5. Mr. Muhammad Abdullah Khan Sumbal, Chief Secretary, Punjab
6. Dr. Muhammad Sohail Anwar Choudhary, Secretary, Planning & Dev. Board
7. Ms. Musarrat, Special Secretary, Local Govt. Punjab
8. Mr. Rana Saleem, Addl. Secretary (Admn) LG, Punjab
9. Mr. Sajid Rasul, Director General, BOS, Punjab
10. Ms. Fareha Tehseen, Additional Secretary (G), Education, Punjab
11. Mr. Sheraz Hussain, Director, SMBR, Punjab

Sindh

12. Mr. Usman Moazzam, Secretary Local Govt. Sindh
13. Mr. Junaid Samoo, Programm Manager, Education Dept. Sindh
14. Mr. Qamar ud Din Alvi, Deputy Secretary, Board of Revenue, Sindh
15. Dr. Ishaq Ahmed Ansari, Director General, BOS, Sindh
16. Mr. Muhammad Nasir, Deputy Director, BOS, Sindh

Balochistan

17. Mr. Dostain Khan Jamaldini, Sec. Local Govt. Balochistan
18. Mr. Abdur Rauf Baloch, Secretary, Secondary Education, Balochistan
19. Mr. Roshan Ali Sheikh, SMBR, Balochistan
20. Mr. Khadim Hussain, Secretary, Election Cell., Balochistan
21. Mr. Rizwan, Deputy Focal Person, Education Dept. Balochistan

Azad Jammu & Kashmir

22. Dr. Muhammad Usman Chachar, Chief Secretary, AJK
23. Mr. Muhammad Razzaq Nadeem, Secretary, E&SE, AJK
24. Mr. Zahid Shafi, Addl. Secretary, Higher Education, AJK
25. Mr. Tariq, Divisional Director (Schools) Education Dept. AJK

Gilgit Baltistan

26. Mr. Mohi-ud-Din Wani, Chief Secretary, GB
27. Mr. Iqbal Hussain, Secretary Home/ PCC, GB
28. Mr. Wali Khan, SMBR, GB
29. Mr. Muhammad Naeem, Sr. Director, LG & RD, GB
30. Ms. Tasneem Kousar, Deputy Secretary, Education, GB

Press Information Department (PID)

31. Mr. Ashiq Hussain Sheikh, Deputy Director General
