

No. PBS.CP&C-2(2)/2022
Government of Pakistan
M/o Planning Development & Special Initiatives
Pakistan Bureau of Statistics
Islamabad

Subject: **MINUTES OF THE 3RD MEETING OF THE CENSUS MONITORING COMMITTEE HELD ON 12TH SEPTEMBER, 2022**

The 3rd meeting of the Census Monitoring Committee (CMC) constituted by the Council of Common Interest (CCI) was held on 12th September, 2022 at 05:00 P.M under the chair of Prof. Ahsan Iqbal, Federal Minister, M/O PD&SI in the Committee Room (3rd Floor) of the M/O PD&SI, Islamabad to review progress of 7th Population & Housing Census 2022. The list of the participants is at **Annexure A**.

2. Meeting started with the recitation of few verses from the Holy Quran. After the round of introduction of the participants, Dr. Naeem uz Zafar, Chief Statistician, PBS briefed about the agenda of the meeting including implementation status of decisions of 2nd CMC meeting, debriefing on pilot census and briefing on meeting with Chief Minister Sindh.

3. Afterwards, the implementation status of the decision of 2nd CMC meeting was shared and it was informed that with the intervention of Minister PD&SI, Letter of Credit (LC) was issued for Procurement of tablets on 5th August, 2022. He added that on the matter of provision of trainers and census training venues from the provinces D.O. letter was written by the worthy Minister PD&SI to Chief Ministers and subsequently in its pursuance a D.O letter from PBS was also sent to Chief Secretaries for resolving the issue expeditiously. It was informed that substantial progress has been observed and now almost 55% information has been received and PBS is continuously pursuing it with provinces. He acknowledged the extended cooperation/support of the Chief Secretary Balochistan to resolve the issue well in time, resultantly almost 95 % training venues and trainers have been allocated for census preparation received from Balochistan. In compliance of the decision for **addition of column in census questionnaire** for identification of migrants from Illegally Indian Occupied Jammu and Kashmir (IIOJK), it was informed that meeting was convened under Secretary PD&SI on 23rd August, 2022 for detailed deliberations, Chief Secretary AJK, Additional Chief Secretary (Development) and SMBR AJ&K and representative of Ministry of KANA attended the meeting, however no representative from Ministry of Interior attended that meeting, despite the personal pursuance with the Ministry. It was decided that a reference may be sent through Ministry of KANA to Ministry of **Foreign Affairs** and Ministry of **Interior** for policy implications if any, as technically the column can be added in questionnaire after approval of CCI. *The Chair directed the Joint Secretary PD&SI to convene a meeting immediately with Ministry of Interior and Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of KANA and PBS to resolve the matter urgently for inclusion of column in the census questionnaire after the consent of CCI.*

After detailed deliberations the following decision were made: -

Decisions:

- Minister PD&SI directed that the **Ministry of PD&SI convene a meeting regarding the issue of addition of column in census questionnaire** for identification of migrants from Illegally Indian Occupied Jammu and Kashmir (IIOJK) with **Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, PBS and Ministry of KANA** at earliest for resolution of issue.

4. Chief Statistician, PBS afterwards presented detail presentation on the conduct of Pilot Census-2022, its outcomes, learnings and way forward. He informed that PBS has completed the activities of Pilot Census successfully (with certain limitations) with collaboration of NADRA, SUPARCO and NTC in 33 districts of Pakistan. He briefed that the core objective of Pilot Census was to see the functionality of digital system for conduct of census and to get the parameters to review the

census operational plans. The selection criterion of 417 blocks from 33 districts from all provinces/regions of Pakistan was based on the parameters like dispersion, **topography, accessibility, electricity, connectivity, and population density**. After extensive training of 54 (27 subject & 27 IT Trainers) in Islamabad, 754 enumerators and supervisory were trained at 27 training centers in 33 selected districts during 13th to 17th July, 2022. Quality of training and field work was assured through, Training evaluation forms, Control Forms and field monitoring visits. Pre and Post Training Tests conducted for evaluation of Trainers and the Trainees. He apprised that enumeration was completed successfully 89% of the selected blocks, however it is worth mentioning that in remaining 46 blocks, 60% of enumeration was completed, which improves completion rate to 95%. This gives assurance that work in one block will be completed in allotted 15 days with proper planning of the issues subject to non- recurrence of hardware and software issues, which occurred to some extent in pilot census. However; despite overall success, there were several shortcomings which created impediments in the smooth execution and testing of the whole system like old tablets, non-provision of all 8 prioritized software modules and delay in provision of required high resolution imagery. *It was informed that one major missing software was "Progress Monitoring", which was supposed to provide level-based access to relevant administrators to track census progress in their relevant area. The software is supposed to increase Provincial stakeholders' confidence in census process and hence outcome, thus making it credible, however due to non-provision, it was not tested.* He appreciated the coordination and support of all partners and was of view that overall performance is satisfactory considering the fact that "Digital Census" is new for every organization and timelines are very challenging. He added that the execution of pilot census was a great learning experience for all partner organizations and issues identified during process will be addressed before full rollout. However, to test the complete census software, new tablets and the complete infrastructure, it is proposed that a mini pilot may be conducted after 15th October, 2022 by PBS staff to avoid any complication in full rollout, besides quality assurance of full system by third party validation on need basis.

5. While, presenting the revised timeline, Chief Statistician, PBS explained that NADRA has committed to deliver all the tablet devices by 30th December, 2022, followed by one-month training of field staff (120,000) at tehsil level, therefore, PBS will be able to conduct the census field activity by 1st February to 4th March, 2023, and subsequently may be able to handover the results to ECP by 30th April, 2023. The worthy Minister PD&SI shown his concern on the timelines and was of view as conduct of next elections depends on the provision of results of Census 2022 it will create undue political and constitutional crises. The Chair asked NADRA to look in to matter and expedite the delivery process of tablets for early provision, further PBS may squeeze the timeline wherever possible and by rescheduling the training at tehsil level. He further directed that ECP may also be invited in CMC meetings as it is the most important stakeholder.

- Mr. Tariq Malik, Chairman NADRA, informed that NADRA has already worked proactively with the supplier and after continuous pursuance they are providing one batch of almost 21600 tablets in 21 days, instead of 62 days. Further the airlift of last batch can only reduce the time by one week. He was of view that while reviewing the whole census plan in holistic manner, it may be possible to curtail timelines of some activities to achieve the target.
- Mr. Usman Chachar, Chief Secretary AJK was of view that there is need to identify the critical activities which will affect the whole process to design the work plan. He further added that those activities may be identified which have no dependency on other activity and can run in parallel to reduce the time.
- Mr. Muhammad Sarwar Gondal, Member (Support Services/RM), PBS apprised that PBS has already identified the critical activities and squeezed its timelines even after lapse of more than six months. PBS has already planned the training at provincial and divisional level before complete delivery of all the tablets. However, training at tehsil level cannot be conducted before complete handover of tablets due to two reasons, firstly as per UN principles, enumerator's training may be conducted in proximity of field operations for quality data collection, secondly even if the trainings are conducted earlier, the field work

has to start at same time all over Pakistan. It is further informed that PBS has completed all tasks (which were not dependent on the procurement of tablets & provision of software) including nomination of field staff, establishment of Census support centers, preparation of training material etc. However, for the activities dependent on provision of tablets and complete software by NADRA, the timeline may be curtailed only if NADRA order to deliver tablets earlier than by 30th December, 2022. He further apprised that Digital census is being conducted for the first time in Pakistan, which is very sensitive owing to its importance and linkages with resource allocation, therefore due diligence is required for its effective implementation and any shortcoming in the process may led to controversies. He also apprised that under the Constitution of Pakistan, elections shall be conducted on the last preceding Census officially published therefore there is no restriction on the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to conduct Elections on new census.

Chief Statistician, PBS also informed that there is dire need of release of funds for census as armed forces and NADRA are pressing hard for payment of dues. Mr. Muneer Ahmad, Senior Joint Secretary, Finance Division informed that Finance has allocated Rs. 5 billion in this regard and currently in process of approvals and hopefully the amount will be released soon. Minister PD&SI directed Finance Division to resolve the issue at the earliest for smooth processing and clearance of financial liabilities on PBS regarding Census activities.

After detailed deliberations the following decision were made: -

Decisions:

- Minister PD&SI directed that **NADRA and PBS** may work closely to mutually devise the timelines. NADRA may work in option of squeezing the delivery timelines and PBS may identify the activities which can run in parallel to achieve the target date of 28th February 2022.
- Representatives of Election Commission of Pakistan May be invited in the Census Monitoring Committee meetings and they may also be kept on board regarding all decisions.

6. The meeting was also briefed on the meeting of PBS team with Chief Minister, Sindh regarding on Census Enumeration Methodology. Chief Statistician, PBS explained that a meeting was held on 1st August 2022 at Chief Minister Secretariat, Karachi under the chairmanship of the honorable Chief Minister Sindh, Syed Murad Ali Shah. PBS team and senior officers Government of Sindh and Senator Taj Haider attended the meeting. Dr. Mehtab Karim, renowned demographer from Sindh also attended the meeting. It was informed that explained the census methodology and also briefed that PBS is following the same definition of “**usual place of residence**” referred by CM Sindh in his prior communication with the Prime Minister. It was also explained that as per the studies, generally there is only marginal difference in population by de-facto and de-jure population, however there are huge human and financial implications of adopting the de-facto population. Despite all explanations, CM Sindh and Senator Taj Haider were not fully convinced on the use of de-jure methodology and they may take up this matter with CCI. It was informed by PBS that the matter is of extreme importance and there is need of political intervention to create consensus on the methodology before moving forward, otherwise it is feared that the results of the census may again become controversial. The worthy minister emphasized that Census which is decennial exercise and only being conducted after five years due to reservations of Sindh on census 2017 results, therefore, he directed that Foreign Minister and other stakeholders may be apprised regarding the enumeration methodology, so that matter may be resolved amicably. The outcome of the meeting may be brought in to knowledge of the Chairman Committee for any timely intervention if needed. Further, he directed that the academia, civil society, renowned demographers, and statisticians may be sensitized regarding the process and to ensure transparency and ownership of census process and results and to minimize the elements of controversies.

After detailed deliberations the following decision were made: -

Decisions:

- All relevant stakeholders including Foreign Minister may be apprised regarding the enumeration methodology and 7th Population & Housing Census processes, the “ Digital Census”.
- PBS may sensitize civil society, academia, demographers regarding the census process for ownership and confidence building.

7. The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and from the chair.

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS OF THIRD MEETING OF CENSUS MONITORING COMMITTEE
HELD ON 12TH SEPTEMBER, 2022**

Physical Attendance

1. Mr. Muhammad Ahsan Iqbal, Minister of PD&SI / DCPC (Chairman)
2. Syed Zafar Ali Shah, Secretary PD&SI, Islamabad
3. Mr. Yusuf Khan, Secretary CCI, Islamabad
4. Muhammad Usman Chachar, Chief Secretary AJK
5. Dr. Naeem uz Zafar, Chief Statistician, PBS, Islamabad
6. Mr. Tariq Malik, Chairman NADRA, Islamabad
7. Mr. Muhammad Sarwar Gondal, Member (Support Services/ RM), PBS, Islamabad
8. Mr. Ayazuddin, Member (Census & Surveys), PBS, Islamabad
9. Mr. Muneer Ahmad, Senior Joint Secretary, Finance Division, Islamabad
10. Ms. Rabia Awan, Deputy Director General, PBS, Islamabad
11. Mr. Saeed Ramzan, DG(Admn.) ICT Administration
12. Col Muhammad Jahanzeb Iftikhar, DD (Addl.), M. O. Directorate, GHQ, Rawalpindi
13. Mr. Ashique Hussain Shaikh, Deputy Director General (HP), PID, Islamabad
14. Mr. Imtiaz.M. Janjua., Additional Commissioner, Islamabad
15. Mr. Faheem Khan, Project Director, NADRA, Islamabad
16. Mr. Qaiser Iqbal, Director (Proj), NADRA, Islamabad
17. Mr. Amjad Ali Awan, Director (IT), NTC, Islamabad
18. Mr. Zahoor Ahmed Khan, Director EMIS AJK
19. Ms. Sobia Munawar, Director, PBS, Islamabad
20. Mr. Muhammad Yasir Ishfaq, Director, PBS, Islamabad
21. Mr. Muhammad Ehtesham, Director, PBS, Islamabad
22. Mr. Arshad Mehmood, Chief Statistical officer, PBS, Islamabad
23. Mr. Muhammad Sarfraz, Chief Statistical officer, PBS, Islamabad

Virtual Attendance

1. Mr. Abdul Aziz Uqali, Chief Secretary, Balochistan
2. Mr. Iqbal Hussain, Secretary Home Department/PCC, GB
3. Mr. Tariq, Secretary, SMBR, GB
4. Ch. Mukhtar Hussain, Member, Board of Revenue, Muzaffarabad
5. Mr. Shakeel Ahmed Abro, Additional Secretary, Member Board of Revenue, Sindh
6. Mr. Naveed Haider Sherazi, Member Taxes, Board of Revenue, Punjab
7. Dr. Ishaque Ahmed Ansari, Director General, BoS, Sindh
8. Mr. Muhammad Naeem, Senior Director, LGRD, GB
9. Mr. Nisar Ahmed, Deputy Secretary Home, GB
10. Syed Zaheer-ul-Islam, Secretary Local Government, KP
11. Madam Mussart, Spl. Secretary Local Government, Punjab
12. Rana Saleem, Additional Secretary (Admn), Local Government, Punjab
13. Mr. Ashfaq Ahmed, DG Networks, NADRA, Islamabad
14. Mr. Najam Ahmad Shah, Secretary Local Government, Sindh
15. Mr. Khaliq-ur-Rehman, Director BoS, KP
16. Mr. Ishfaq, Deputy Secretary (Security), Home Department, KP
