**COMPARATIVE STATEMENT OF COMMENTS OF PBS**

**NATIONAL REPORT**

| **S.No** | **Observation** | **Comments** | **Comments/views of Members of Committee** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1. | Main observations of International Observers are following:  |  |  |
| **2.** | * There were poor formal publicity and advocacy campaign for the census as there were very few posters and banners seen even in District/Tehsil census offices.
* Rather, the publicity appeared to be more informal than formal, but people had in general heard about the census exercise from the mosques or through the enumerators during house numbering and listing.
 | * **PBS has launched a Census publicity campaign in both electronic and print media** to appraise the general public about the importance of Population and Housing Census and get their involvement in Census Operation. However in some far fledge not accessible due to satellite and signal problems.
* **Deputy Commissioners were also given funds for publicity at local level.**
 |  |
| **3**. | The enumerators sometimes inferred or directed responses, on such questions as religion, ethnicity, use of energy, water, household amenities and literacy. Enumerators seldom asked questions on disability and transgender (3,4,5,6, categories of Question 3). In many instances, the enumerators inferred the response on disability and transgender because they felt it was culturally sensitive (or offensive) to ask the head of household such questions.  |  |  |
| **4.** | It was also observed that age records were mainly obtained from CNIC card and most often verified by the accompanying army officer through and SMS to NADRA. Sometimes other information on household members was also verified through the same means. Sharing census data with a third party institution majorly represents a breach of confidentiality of the collected data according to the basic census practices and procedures.  | * **It is necessary to mention that Army personnel were verifying the only the number of family members. They were not verifying the ages of the individuals.** Furthermore, NADRA verification by phone was not carrying on regularly, it was used to avoid any false information.
* **Only 6.5 million out of 200 million population were checked out from NADRA**
* It was used only when army personnel felt it was necessary.
 |  |
| **5.** | The army also administered a questionnaire which had information on total number of household members and the detailed nationality of the head of household. This is very unusual and questionable especially given the fact that the main questionnaire had no provision for detailed nationality; this indeed raises concerns of respect of international best practices in terms of protection and confidentiality of collected data. Also refugee villages were not enumerated in the first phase of the census as directed by the government. This is also a breach of international census practice as everyone is supposed to be counted during the census, by the census.  | * Information of number of Household members were collected by Army Personnel for adding credibility to results and used by civil enumerators/army enumerators every day after closing of working hours to recheck the information for avoiding any omission & error.
* Regarding Refugee village it is pertinent to mention that only two Refugee villages were present at the time of Census-2017 and information of these refugee villages was taken from administration of those villages.
 |  |

**COMPARATIVE STATEMENT OF COMMENTS OF PBS**

**PROVINCIAL REPORTS**

| **S.No** | **Observation** | **Comments** | **Comments/views of Members of Committee** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **1.** | In remote area large population without CNIC | CNIC was optional and even persons/family who do not having CNIC was collected in Census process. |  |
| **2.** | In some places, temporary offices were being shared with the revenue department where sensitive revenue materials like receipts and log books were also kept. This was not the good practice as the material could get mixed.  |  |  |
| **3.** | At some Census Blocks the structures were very scattered and far apart. They were not provided with mean of getting from one far structure to another. They were dropped down in the morning and picking them up by 6 pm.  |  |  |
| **4.** | At some places there were no updated maps from PBS regarding on new settlements, the maps were borrowed from Estate developer and revenue department.  | This was happened only at the places where the settlements have expended on the surrounding and updated work could not be carried out before the Census Operation but it was a rare event. |  |
| **5.** | At some places there was the problem of vehicle. There was a distance of nearly half of kilometer between one dwelling unit and other; the vehicle provided them only drop the staff at a particular location, the staff had to move in whole the block by themselves.  | `   |  |
| **6.** | Green markers used in numbering the house did not withstand the sun as it faded after just about two days if it is in direct sun contact with the sun. The rain also washed away some numbers.  |  |  |
| **7.** | Army officer verified the information of the age, especially of women and children through connecting NADRA by phone, which report a breach of confidentiality of the collected data. | It is necessary to mention that Army personnel were verifying only the number of family members. They were not verifying the ages of the individuals. Furthermore, NADRA verification by phone was not carried out regularly. It was used only when army personnel felt it was necessary. Only 6.5 million out of 200 million population were checked out from NADRA. |  |
| **8.** | Army was indeed running an independent parallel data collection, which hardly aligns with accepted international standards.  | During the Population and Housing Census-1998 one Armed Forces personnel was accompanied with civil enumerator and also filled in the 786 form to ensure deterrence for the wrong doers and for giving credibility to Census data. The same pattern has also been used in the 6th Population and Housing Census- 2017. |  |
| **9.** | Census publicity was not observed in GB. | PBS has launched a Census publicity campaign in both electronic and print media to appraise the general public about the importance of Population and Housing Census and get their involvement in Census Operation except in some far fledge areas not accessible due to satellite and signal problems. |  |
| **10.** | This soldier did quite often sent SMS to NADRA which raise strong questions regarding confidentiality of data and future use of this data.  | This soldier did not send the information collected through Census to NADRA. He was just checking the NADRA Data Base not sharing our data with NADRA. |  |
| **11.** | Enumerators were very confused about usual place of residence. |  |  |
| **12.** | In Mansehra district house listing had took place with house enumeration due to huge census block size (upto 1500 structures against the average 250-300 elsewhere) | The census bocks have been formed by PBS having a small compact area / contiguous geographical area in nature and having identifiable boundaries. These blocks contains about 200-250 houses on an average and same enumerator collects data from the block. During field operation, the number of houses in a block may exceed because the population of the country has increased and new colonies, towns, have emerged/ constructed, therefore, in such situations additional staff has been deputed in such areas from reserve staff to cover the entire block in stipulated time.  |  |
| **13.** | Lack of female enumerator in the field cause reluctance for the female respondent to given information about households. | Approximately 2342 females enumerators have been appointed in big Urban Areas /Cantonments in various census districts during the 6th Population and Housing Census-2017 |  |
| **14.** | In Mansehra and Peshawar new entire villages were identified by the enumerators but these are not mapped at all. | Census maps were updated by the experienced staff of PBS throughout the country. After updation, digital maps with geo reference GPS coordinates were taken in urban areas, whereas the Geo referred maps for rural area could not be prepared for Census-2017 due to paucity of time. In case of rural areas manual revenue maps of the mauza /deh showing blocks boundaries on these manual maps have been prepared with the help of Provincial Revenue Department. The copies of manual maps drawn by the Revenue Department have been provided to field staff. However some new creations of settlements in the district might not be added/ updated in the maps.  |  |
| **15.** | Ownership of facilities like computer and internet connectivity related questions may also not come with accurate data.  | This question has been asked of every household collectively. The enumerator has asked the household members if they have all these facilities or they use it. It may happen that household does not own any one of these facilities but nonetheless they are being used by the members of the household. |  |
| **16.** | The observers pointed out that block maps were not available with the enumerator while visiting in three Census Blocks. | Not possible without maps |  |
| **17.** | It had also been observed that the team that question about having separate kitchen was not asking mostly and some enumerators left it upon respondent to decide whether they were joint family member or else. |  |  |
| **18.** | The observer team also pointed out that the majority of the enumerators were from Education Department but some were found Clerks and Lab Attendants.  |  |  |
| **19.** | Interview techniques |  |  |
| **20.** | The enumerators who were observed during Round of Phase-I were more careful to ask about transgender and disability but during Round-II very few of them were found to ask these questions from the respondents. |  |  |
| **21.** | In certain areas it was also found that major (Army personnel) have fixed a target of 50 households per enumerator per day which was problematic and cause huge impact on the accuracy of data collected. |  |  |
| **22.** | The main office room and control room were clean, but the room where blank questionnaire were stored was dusty. The blank questionnaires were securely stored but it was not well organized. Boxes were piled in a non-sequential order, in a somewhat disorganized manner.  |  |  |
| **23.** | Enumerators, circle supervisors and charge superintendent informed to the team that they had not even received the payments corresponding to the training period. The delay in payment to census staff can affect their motivational level. |  |  |
| **24**. | The census process was facing delays due to appointment of a large number of reserved staff because numbers of households were greater than expected.  |  |  |
| **25.** | The military was of the view that retrieval and storage of completed questionnaires was their duty. After some time the military realized that it was not their responsibility.  |  |  |

**LIST OF INTERNATIONAL / NATIONAL OBSERVERS**

| **International Monitors** | **National Monitor** | **Region** | **Date of Visits** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Ms. Uzoma Okoye Nationality :- Nigeria | Dr. Naushin Mahmood Demographer | **Punjab** | **23rd March to 8th April 2017** |
| Dr. Rafiq Chandio \* Professor , University of Sindh |
| Mr. Emmanuel Igah Nationality:- France | Dr. Nousheen Raza Lecture Of Sociology and Demography, University of Karachi | **Sindh** | **23rd March to 8th April 2017** |
| Mr. Amin Hussain, Lecturer, Economics Department, LUMS |
| Dr. Sola Asa Nationality :- Nigeria | Dr. Rasheeda Panezai, Chairperson MAHEC Helping Council for Community Development and Welfare Balochistan | **KP** | **27th March to 5th April 2017** |
| Mr. Jamil Ahmad Chitrali Director/Professor Institute of Peace & Conflict Studies University of Peshawar |
| Dr. Sola Asa Nationality :- Nigeria | Dr. Rasheeda Panezai Chairperson MAHEC Helping Council for Community Development and Welfare Balochistan | **AJ&K** | **6th April to 8th April 2017** |
| Mr. Jamil Ahmad Chitrali Director/Professor Institute of Peace & Conflict Studies University Of Peshawar |
| Ronnie Anderson Nationality:- Sweeden | Dr. Mujeeb ur Rahman Professor/ Head of Department of Mathematics & Statistics Karakoram International University Gilgit Baltistan | **GB** | **1st April to 8th April 2017** |
| Mr. Asif Wazir Consultant/Demographer |
| Mr. Ricardo Neupert Nationality: Chile | Syed Mohammad Nabeel, Chairman, Department of Economics, Balochistan University of Information Technology and Management Sciences | **Balochistan** | **27th March to 8th April 2017** |
| Dr.Asad Ullah Assistant Professor, Department of Mathematics & Statistics, Karakoram International University Gilgit Baltistan |
|  | Dr. Rafiq Chandio \* Professor , University of Sindh | **Punjab Team 2 for South Punjab** | **1st April to 8th April 2017** |
| Dr. Zilakat Khan Malik Professor Chairman Department Of Economics University of Peshawar |
| Muhammad Usman Lecturer, Department Of Mathematics & Statistics University of Agriculture, Faisalabad ( Still not confirmed) |