

No. 1(2)/2004-PBS (Coord)
Government of Pakistan
Statistics Division
Pakistan Bureau of Statistics

Subject: MINUTES OF THE CONSULTATIVE MEETING OF EXPERTS TO DISCUSS FINAL RESULTS OF CENSUS-2017.

A Consultative meeting of Experts, Senior Officers of Statistics Division/ Pakistan Bureau of Statistics and Consultant on census from UNFPA to discuss the Final Results of Census-2017 before presentation to the CCI was held on 12th May, 2018 at 11:00 AM under the Chairperson of Secretary, Statistics Division in the Conference Room of Statistics House, Islamabad. The list of participants is **attached**.

2. Meeting started with the recitation of versus from Holy Quran. Chair welcomed the participants and informed that PBS has compiled the Final Results of Census-2017. This meeting has been convened to discuss the final results and to have suggestions from the Experts for improvement of the National Census Report as per recommendation of the Experts to make it as per international standards. The Final Results of Census-2017 will be presented before the Council Common of Interests (CCI) in its meeting to be held on 14th May, 2018 for approval. The participants thanked the Chair for inviting them for this consultative session and sharing the final census results with them before submission to the CCI. Chair asked the Member (C&S) to give presentation to the house.

3. The Member (C&S) presented the proposed tables on key indicators to be incorporated in the National Census Report, 2017. The main indicators presented in the meeting included total population, sex ratio, population density, rural / urban distribution, average annual growth rates, provincial shares, population distribution by religion, mother tongue and literacy ratio etc.

4. In addition to above, issues on Afghan Refugees living in Camps, blocked CNICs, Diplomats living in the country during census operation and adjustment of TDPs in their respective Agencies were discussed for decision to be taken by the house. The house was informed that no significant variation between provisional and final results of Census-2017 have been observed, which constitute a difference of 68,738 individuals with percentage variation as -0.033%. Prof. Dr. Nancy Stiegler, Consultant, UNFPA appreciated the quality of compilation of results in two stages i.e. provisional and final results by observing a negligible difference. While quoting international practices, she

mentioned that generally observance of around 5% margin of errors is acceptable in the Census results worldwide.

5. During the meeting the participants raised following observations and gave suggestions accordingly.

- i) In response to Dr. Zeba A. Sathar's question relating to occurrence of similar differences at lower side in all of the provinces, Member (C&S) mentioned that in some districts positive differences were also observed, but these differences were balanced out at compilation stage and negative differences have been observed at Provincial and National level.
- ii) Dr. G. M. Arif asked about the reasons for higher average household size and larger share of KP and Balochistan Provinces in the total population as compared to 1998-Census. Member (C&S) explained that the same was observed due to counting of Afghan Refugees living common population while in 1998, this segment of population was confined to Refugee Camps only. Regarding greater household size in these provinces, he agreed with results compiled and also quoted certain indicators such as total fertility rate, children ever born and average household sizes at National and Provincial level in support of the census results.
- iii) Dr. Muhammad Iqbal enquired about the uniform occurrence of negative differences between provisional and final results with the remarks that whether it is due to estimation or any other reason. Member(C&S) explained the reasons as mentioned in the earlier para's.
- iv) Mr. G. M. Arif asked about difference of blocks observed in FATA and ICT Islamabad in the Provisional and Final Results. Mrs. Rabia Awan, Director explained that duplicate blocks were found in ICT and FATA which were corrected during compilation of final results, therefore, the change occurred in the provisional and final results. He also pointed out that the sex ratio of KP and FATA is on lower side. The Member(C&S) informed that due to working of male members of the household of KP and FATA in the middle east or other countries, such individuals have not been

enumerated in the census process, therefore, the sex ratio is lower as compared to the other provinces. It was proposed that the population of KP and FATA need to be analyzed in the light of TDPs population.

- v) Dr. Minhaj ul Haq enquired about the counting of population of Afghan Refugees which have moved in settled areas of Punjab. The Member(C&S) explained the procedure of enumeration of Afghans Refugees living mixed up in common population as well as living in Camps.

6. After detail discussion, following recommendations/decisions were made:-

i) **Youth Population with Age Group**

It was decided that youth population comprising of age group 15-24 years may also be added in the presentation as well as in the National Census Report.

ii) **Urban / Rural Proportion**

It was decided that Urban / Rural share in the total population may not be shown in the presentation, however, the same may be included in the National Census Report.

iii) **Tables on distribution of Population by Mother Tongue and Religion**

It was decided that the comparison of above table may not be made with the data of 1998-Census in the presentation. However, the same may be made part of the National Census Report.

iv) **Single Year Age Pyramid**

The house was informed that the age data reported in the census on single year age was not found consistent due to age heaping and digit preference. The Consultants from UNFPA suggested data smoothing

through 3 years and 5 years moving averages techniques. The Consultants suggested that smoothed single year age data can be reported in the National and Provincial Census Reports, however, in case of District Census Reports (DCR) the age data may be represented in the form of 5 years age groups. The house agreed to the recommendation and decided to act upon accordingly.

v) **Marital Status**

It was decided that Table on Marital status table may not be shown in the presentation. However, it may be made part of the National Census Report.

vi) **Literacy Ratio**

It was observed that slide on the literacy ratio is too congested, hence the column of total population in the slide may be deleted and columns pertaining to literate population and literacy ratios may be retained in the slide. However, the same information may be retained in the National Census Report.

vii) **Disability Data**

The house observed that the data on disabled population collected during current census is not comparable with 1998-Census while the same is not up to the mark as compared with the data of 1998 Census. The Member(C&S) explained the reasons for under coverage of disabled population in the current census to the house. It was decided that disability data may not be shown in the presentation, however, it may be made part of the National Census Report highlighting the reasons of under coverage.

viii) **Adjustment of TDPs Population in their Agencies of Origin**

The house was informed that in the meeting held with the authorities of SAFRON, FATA Secretariat, FDMA and Political Leadership of FATA, it was decided that registered TDPs of three Agencies namely South Waziristan, North Waziristan and Orakzai Agency enumerated outside the

above mentioned Agencies will be adjusted in the population of respective Agencies of their origin. Accordingly, a list of registered TDPs from FDMA has been obtained which was shared with NADRA authorities for verification of their CNICs and process of matching of this data with the census data base is in-hand. The population so matched will be shifted from outside Agencies to the respective Agencies.

The house objected on the process of shifting of TDPs with a view that according to the Dejure approach the population should be enumerated in the areas where they were residing at the time of census operation. Hence, shifting of such population from the area of their residence to respective Agencies is against the practice, therefore, the house is not in favor of this adjustment. After long debate, it was decided that the TDPs population may be counted in the areas where they were residing at the time of census operation and may not be shifted to their respective Agencies.

ix) **Issues of Blocked CNICs Data, Afghan Refugees in Camps & Diplomats**

The issues regarding shifting of population from Pakistanis to non-Pakistanis on the basis of blocked CNICs in the census data base exclusively on the basis of confirmed Aliens reported by NADRA authorities, inclusion of population of Afghan Refugees living in Camps and population of Diplomats residing in the country during census operation as provided by Ministry of Foreign Affairs were discussed in the house. The house was of the view that data of the above categories may not be included in the census results with the view that no demographic indicators are available regarding above categories.

7. Meeting ended with vote of thanks from the Chair.

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS OF CONSULTATIVE MEETING OF EXPERTS TO DISCUSS
FINAL RESULTS OF CENSUS-2017 HELD ON 12th MAY, 2018**

- 1) Ms. Rukhsana Yasmin, Secretary, Statistics Division, Islamabad
- 2) Mr. Nasir Jamal, Senior Joint Secretary, Statistics Division, Islamabad
- 3) Dr. Sajjad Akhtar, Chief Statistician, PBS, Islamabad
- 4) Dr. Muhammad Iqbal, Member Governing Council
- 5) Dr. Syed Muhammad Arif, Member Governing Council
- 6) Dr. Zeba A. Sathar, Country Director, Population Council, Islamabad
- 7) Dr. G.M. Arif, Member Governing Council
- 8) Dr. Naushin Mehmood, Member Governing Council
- 9) Prof. Dr. Nancy Stiegler, Consultant, UNFPA, Islamabad
- 10) Dr. Minhajul Haq, Expert, Population Association of Pakistan
- 11) Mr. Habib Ullah Khan, Member (C&S), PBS, Islamabad
- 12) Mr. Muhammad Sarwar Gondal, Member (SS/RM), PBS, Islamabad
- 13) Dr. Bahrawar Jan, Member (NA), PBS, Islamabad
- 14) Mr. Khalid Hussain, DDG (Computer), PBS, Islamabad
- 15) Mr. Muhammad Ashraf, Census Commissioner, PBS, Islamabad
- 16) Mrs. Rabia Awan, Director, PBS, Islamabad
- 17) Mr. Liaquat Ali Chattha, FMO(CP&C), PBS, Islamabad
- 18) Mr. Inamullah Khan, ACC(CP&C), PBS, Islamabad
- 19) Mr. Hazrat Khan, ACC(Table Verification), PBS, Islamabad
- 20) Mr. Muhamamd Saleem, ACC(FO), PBS, Islamabad
- 21) Mr. Saeed Ahmed, ACC(DP), PBS, Islamabad
