

No . 2(1)/2017-PBS(C)  
Government of Pakistan  
Statistics Division  
Pakistan Bureau of Statistics  
\*\*\*\*\*

Subject: MINUTES OF THE 4<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE OF GOVERNING COUNCIL OF PAKISTAN BUREAU OF STATISTICS

The 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Sub-Committee of the Governing Council of Pakistan Bureau of Statistics was held on 20<sup>th</sup> February, 2017 at 11:00 am in the Committee room of Pakistan Bureau of Statistics under the Chair of Dr. Zeba A. Sathar, Chairperson of the Sub-committee and Member of the Governing Council. The list of participants is enclosed.

2. The meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairperson welcomed the members and opened the discussion with a focus on population having alien/foreigner status. In this regard, she pointed out that many issues we have to deal with are almost same which were dealt in 1998-Census. Chair informed the participants that Army will collect data about country of origin from non-Pakistanis but only enumerators should ask this information and Modus operandi should be clear. Further, it was pointed out that in Peshawar/ KPK there are more areas where Afghans are living and getting detailed information which could lead to problems at the block level.

3. Second issue she highlighted was the counting of religious minorities. Chair believed that some issues can be fixed before census operation and some after the census. Frequency Tables for Foreigner/National data should be produced separately.

4. Dr. G.M. Arif argued that enumerator could easily collect this information the way form is designed. It is just counting of households and every line captures information for separate household and if there are Non-Pakistanis in household then enumerator can ask the number of non-Pakistanis at aggregate level within a household.

5. Dr. Mehtabe gave reference to his research in Saudi Arabia where he found SA collects all data by Saudis and Non-Saudis, separately. However, in Pakistan it would be difficult to collect such data with accuracy. For example, in Karachi if a family has a Bangladeshi cook, everyone in Muhallah knows about it but at the time of enumeration it is unlikely that any one will report his/her nationality, correctly. At this the Chair reiterated that recommendations have been passed on to PBS in this regard thus, recording of ID should be optional. Dr. Farooq from LUMS added that we would be counting foreigners but it will be undercounting. Members from Peshawar informed that when respondents will see enumerators with Army they will not reveal their identity.



6. To further shed light on this topic, Dr. Mukhtar alluded to UN approach which is humanistic, however, general mind set is that UN wants to make foreigners part of Pakistan, which is incorrect. He posed a question that who is behind foreign office? And on daily basis foreigners are being caught, Afghanis in context of current security situation, while, Balochistan, Pashtoons, Sindh want to jack up their population.
7. However, Dr. Muhammad Iqbal and Dr Qamar uz Zaman disagreed with Dr. Mehtab's point and argued that Afghanis will report themselves as Pakistanis since some of them have reached assemblies too. Dr. Shujat Ali, Secretary Statistics Division endorsed their point of view and said that for local politicians these are extra votes. Therefore, even they try to get them registered with NADRA. Dr. Qamar also informed that these Afghans are particular about their identification but for all practical purposes they declare themselves as Pakistanis.
8. To sum up, Chair asked that how do we desensitize people and to make them realize about advantage of being counted. Dr. GM Arif joined the discussion by saying that lets keep simple things simple and too much restriction on Army will be counterproductive, this was highlighted during discussion about form to be used by Army soldier.
9. Dr. Mukhtar said that real issue will be in Karachi due to recent operation of Army and suggested solution of verification of data through SMS appear to be impractical, for example, how would we know if same ID card is not being used in different blocks? Only way we can be sure that same card is reported twice is at the time of data processing which would be too late. Dr. GM Arif suggested Dr. Mukhtar to revisit recommendations of subcommittee again in which SMS issue has already been addressed and broad guidelines have been shared with PBS.
10. Upon this, Dr. Zeba desired that there should be huge message/advertisement on Media that recording of ID card is optional, otherwise, Census would be meaningless if we miss any data. Dr. Farooq highlighted that this optional ID card sharing is for filling up all the forms to be administered in Census taking. So the decision to generalize the instructions may be taken and make it public through Media which was endorsed by the Chair.
11. Dr. Mehtab highlighted the freedom and independence of Media. Dr. Zeba explained that Media is so powerful that through campaign they can change consumers' preferences, Roohafzah has been replaced by Pepsi as number one beverage in Pakistan per say. However, Dr. Shujat Ali, Dr. Syed Arif, Dr. Iqbal and Dr. Qamar suggested that main objective is to count Pakistani as Pakistani and Non-Pakistani as Non-Pakistani and every effort should be made in this direction.
12. Moving on to the next issue, it was pointed out by a member that what if somebody wants to dispute the results so where it should be referred to? The Chair replied that PBS knows exactly where those issues should be sent.



13. Chief Statistician, Mr. Asif Bajwa, informed the participants that previous suggestions have been shared with Finance Minister for approval regarding CNIC and De-jure and De facto method of enumeration. However, arrangements can be made, if members wish to make any changes in recommendations already submitted to Ministry. The Chair, however, informed that all are happy with the draft already shared and do not want to request any changes.

14. The Chair again discussed the issue of Army role in Census Operation and stressed that instructions for Army should be very clear. Dr. Qamr uz Zaman inquired who will issue the instructions for Army. Chief Statistician informed worthy member that PBS will issue the instructions.

15. Next question was about the satisfying KPK and Balochistan about above process, and the Chair asked about information of flash point districts. Chief Statistician informed that uniform treatment will be carried out in all the areas. Law and order is the responsibility of police anyway. For so called flash point areas, we also have support of Army.

16. Another supplementary question was about treatment of special areas i.e. Afghan settlements and it was decided to discuss it in next meeting.

17. Dr. Qamar uz Zaman, stressed upon that media briefings should be increased and it was informed that PBS is arranging such meetings on regular intervals. Regarding Media coverage, it was informed that Media houses have been short listed and soon there will be full fledged campaign on Media which is based on inputs from experts including UNFPA consultant Dr. Lucy and Dr. Nancy.

18. Expanding the discussion further, the Chairperson referred to news items of print media few of which were negative. To elaborate her point, she referred to a news item in which it was mentioned that Sikhs and Parsi will not be recorded separately. So suggested to add two more codes for these two religions. Chief Statistician informed that questionnaire was finalized by over 100 experts in 2008, and all of these issues were discussed during those consultative meetings. To add, Mr. Khattak, Member-C&S informed the house that significant number of trainers have gone back to their homes after getting training. Therefore, it will be very difficult to explain them about the suggested changes. The questionnaire was approved by Cabinet followed by CCI. However, committee insisted on to add more religious groups, out of concern about inclusion of minorities. The committee strongly recommended the inclusion of 2 more religious groups i.e. Sikhs and Parsis in the question 6 about religion. This could be done by filling in codes 7&8 in the column 6 of the Census form 2, Code 6 remains for "others". Additional instructions should be issued to the supervisors immediately.



ve be-      afi "ans " "ou"

## LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

- 1) Dr. Zeba A. Sathar, Country Director, Population Council, Islamabad
- 2) Dr. Shujat Ali, Secretary, Statistics Division, Islamabad
- 3) Mr. Asif Bajwa, Chief Statistician, PBS, Islamabad
- 4) Mr. Muhammad Iqbal, Professor, University of Peshawar, Peshawar
- 5) Dr. G.M. Arif, Ex-Director, PIDE, Islamabad
- 6) Dr. Mehtab S. Karim, Vice Chancellor, Malir University, Karachi
- 7) Dr. Muhammad Farooq Naseer, LUMS, Lahore
- 8) Dr. Qamruz Zaman, Professor, Peshawar University, Peshawar
- 9) Mr. Habib Ullah Khan, Member (C&S), PBS, Islamabad
- 10) Mr. Fazlullah Qureshi, Former Federal Secretary
- 11) Mr. Rizwan Bashir, Director (CP&C), PBS, Islamabad
- 12) Prof. Nancy Stiegler, Census Advisor, UNFPA ( She was invited for presentation on media at the end)

\*\*\*\*\*